by Welander,[4] which seems to be of interest, e.g., in oceanography.

In conclusion I should like to give the following qualitative description of the mechanism for the generation of the instability in the airlift pump, a description which can be easily translated to other similar systems. Consider a harmonic small oscillation of the velocity around its stationary value at the injection zone. Under the half period, when this oscillation is negative, it causes a decrease in the density below its stationary value, which decrease is propagated with the flow and builds up an accelerating force. This accelerating force must reach its maximum on the elements in the injection zone after a lapse of time, which is of the same order of magnitude as the time of travel of the fluid through the pipe. If now this maximum is in phase with the maximum of the acceleration of the original oscillation, an overshooting occurs, producing growing amplitude of the oscillation, i.e., instability. If the condition (86) of my paper is interpreted according to this view, it is seen to give a time of travel as calculated from the velocity (42) of about a third ($1/\sqrt{8}$) of the time of oscillation as calculated from the coefficient of κ in (70).

[4] Welander, P., "On the Oscillatory Instability of a Differentially Heated Fluid Loop," *Journal of Fluid Mechanics*, Vol. 29, Part 1, 1967, pp. 17–30.

Behavior of Dilute Polymer Solutions in the Inlet Region of a Pipe[1]

W. MICHAEL LAI.[2] One of the conclusions, stated in the concluding remarks of the paper is that for dilute polymer solutions, characterized by the constitutive equations (24) and (31), the theory predicts shorter inlet length and greater pressure drop, in agreement with the results of Tomita and Yamane [10]. On examining equations (48), (51), and Table 1, it is seen that the inlet length is shorter and the pressure drop greater for $1.0 \leq m \leq 1.30$, whereas for $m = 1.50$, exactly the opposite is true and it appears that at some value of m between 1.30 and 1.50, the presence of elasticity has no effect at all on either the inlet length or the pressure drop. What significance, if any, is to be given to this value of m? Can one extrapolate the result of Table 1 to conclude that for say, $m = 2$, C_2 is positive, and $(\Delta p)_{\text{elastic}}$ is negative?

On comparing equation (32) and (33) of the paper with equations (4) and (5) of reference [10], it appears that for the case $n = 1$ and $m = 2$ $\left(\text{in the notation of the present paper, i.e., } t_{zr} = -\eta\left(-\frac{\partial u}{\partial r}\right) \text{ and } t_{zz} - t_{rr} = 2\tau\left(-\frac{\partial u}{\partial r}\right)^2\right)$, the conclusions from the present paper and reference [10] are opposite (if extrapolation of the numerical values are valid).

Is it really necessary to invoke the Weissenberg's conjecture that $t_{rr} - t_{\theta\theta} = 0$? It appears that with α_i's assumed to be $0(\delta^2)$ it follows $t_{rr} - t_{\theta\theta} = 0(1)$ so that its contribution to the pressure change across the boundary layer is $0(\delta)$.

It is noted that the tensors $A_n (n = 2, 3, \ldots)$ used in the paper, equations (22) and (23), are related to but not the same as the Rivlin-Ericksen tensors as defined in say, *Encyclopedia of Physics*, Vol. III/3, p. 54.

[1] By E. Bilgen, published in the June, 1973, issue of the JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS, Vol. 40, TRANS. ASME, Vol. 95, Series E, pp. 381–387.

[2] Associate Professor of Mechanics, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, Troy, N. Y.

Author's Closure

The analysis presented is strictly on the behavior of dilute polymer solutions and $m > 1.30$ does not have any physical significance. From the mathematical point of view, it should be noted however that the sign change in Table 1 for $m > 1.30$ and the impossibility to extrapolate the results for m near 2 can be attributed to the failure of the integral method and in that sense, a refinement using other methods discussed in the Introduction of the paper may be of help.

$\alpha_i = 0\ (\delta^2)$ is the necessary condition obtained from the stress equation of motion; hence if it is assumed that $\alpha_i = 0(\delta^2)$, obviously the Weissenberg's conjecture will prevail and vice versa.

The Response of an Elastic Disk With a Moving Mass System[1]

C. D. Mote, JR.[2] The discusser finds this paper by Prof. W. D. Iwan and Dr. K. J. Stahl very interesting and a noteworthy contribution to the now voluminous circular plate literature. The discusser has also been interested in these problems for sometime and he would like to remark that one of his papers [1][3] may be an important companion for the present research. In his paper the Greens' function for a centrally clamped, peripherally free, circular plate is formulated as a eigenfunction expansion, similar to that in the authors' paper, and the plate response is investigated for two circumnavigating, peripheral prescribed loads. One is the rotating harmonic load, which includes as a special case the critical speed phenomenon mentioned by the authors. The second as a load whose speed contains a harmonic component which is similar to what occurs in some industrial processes. The paper includes detailed, exact eigensolutions including 50 eigenvalues and corresponding eigenfunctions in a tabular form for these plates with $b/a = 0.5$. The discusser believes this is not unlike clamping radii used in computer disk file memory units. It appears that these eigensolutions can be directly applied to the formation of D in [28] and thereby extend the authors' results to the other plates with little effort.

The question of disk operation above its critical speed is a very interesting one, and the discusser understands from the authors' introduction that this is now common. The discusser has held the idea that stable operation above the lowest critical speed was unlikely. Tobias and Arnold [17] showed in the laboratory that instability extended over a wide rotation range, even for a concentrated moving load, because of nonlinear effects not contained in the linear, critical speed analysis. Dugdale [2] has independently commented that stable operation above the critical speed is unlikely. In some of the discussers' studies [1, 3] operation above the critical speed was possible only in the absence of loading. The results in Fig. 4 of the present paper indicate a "broadened" instability region above the critical speed. One can assume that nonlinear effects would broaden it somewhat further. In many critical speed problems the modes (number of nodal diameters and nodal circles) of potential instability are quite close. That is, in the authors Fig. $4j/\bar{P}_{jn}$ does not differ greatly for values of $j = 2 - 6$. It appears then that overlapping of instability regions will occur. Besides the interesting implications of this overlapping, the present paper seems to indicate that the potential for instability can only be increased by the moving

[1] By W. D. Iwan and K. J. Stahl, published in the June, 1973, issue of the JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS, Vol. 40, TRANS. ASME, Vol. 95, Series E, pp. 445–451.

[2] Department of Mechanical Engineering, University of California, Berkeley, Calif.

[3] Numbers in brackets designate References at end of Discussion.

