

## DISCUSSION

the case of constant tension. The case of the cable with non-negligible weight has a rather extensive bibliography for both the static [1, 2, 3]<sup>3</sup> and the dynamic cases [4, 5, 6]. Eringen [7] shows that extensional deformations need not be neglected in deriving the author's equation (17). In reference [3], the methods developed by Moser [8] and Wasow [9] for singular perturbation differential equations have been used to obtain solutions of this equation similar to those of equations (41) and (42) of the author's paper but for the more general case of linearly varying axial tension caused by the weight of the cable. It is also shown there that the author's restriction to small angles is not necessary and that the effects of constant horizontal and vertical forces can be absorbed into the boundary conditions. The results he obtains, indicating that superposition can be used for calculating bending moments in the presence of lateral forces even for rather large angles, should be of interest for the important practical problem of offshore casings loaded laterally by tidal currents.

## References

- 1 Lubinski, A., "A Study of the Buckling of Rotary Drilling Strings," *Drilling and Production Practice*, API, 1950, pp. 178-214.
- 2 Lubinski, A., and Woods, H. B., "Factors Affecting the Angle of Inclination and Dog-Legging of Rotary Bore Holes," *Drilling and Production Practice*, API, 1953, pp. 165-182.
- 3 Plunkett, R., "Static Buckling Stresses in Catenaries and Drill Strings," *Journal of Engineering for Industry*, TRANS. ASME, Series B, Vol. 89, 1967, pp. 31-36.
- 4 (a) Graham, R. D., Frost, M. A., III, and Wilhoit, J. C., Jr., "Analysis of the Motion of Deep-Water Drill Strings—Part 1: Forced Lateral Motion," *Journal of Engineering for Industry*, TRANS. ASME, Series B, Vol. 87, 1965, pp. 137-144.  
(b) Frost, M. A., III, and Wilhoit, J. C., Jr., "Analysis of the Motion of Deep-Water Drill Strings—Part 2: Forced Rolling Motion," *ibid.*, 1965, pp. 145-149.
- 5 Frohrib, D. A., and Plunkett, R., "The Free Vibrations of Stiffened Drill Strings With Static Curvature," *Journal of Engineering for Industry*, TRANS. ASME, Series B, 1967, Vol. 89, pp. 23-29.
- 6 Huang, T., and Dareing, D. W., "Predicting the Stability of Long Vertical Pipe Transmitting Torque in a Viscous Medium," *Journal of Engineering for Industry*, TRANS. ASME, Series B, Vol. 88, 1966, pp. 191-200.
- 7 Eringen, A. C., "On the Nonlinear Vibration of Elastic Bars," *Quarterly of Applied Mathematics*, Vol. 9, Jan. 1952, p. 361.
- 8 Moser, J., "Singular Perturbation of Eigenvalue Problems for Linear Differential Equations of Even Order," *Communications on Pure and Applied Mathematics*, Vol. 8, 1955, pp. 251-278.
- 9 Wasow, W., "Singular Perturbations of Boundary-Value Problems for Nonlinear Differential Equations of Second Order," *Communications on Pure and Applied Mathematics*, Vol. 9, 1956, pp. 93-113.

**R. SCHMIDT<sup>4</sup> and D. A. DaDEPPO.<sup>5</sup>** The nonlinear differential equations governing the three problems considered by the author can also be linearized with the aid of Chebyshev polynomials [10-12].<sup>6</sup> Such linearization yields more accurate results than the so-called "small-angle approximation," i.e., linearization with the aid of Maclaurin expansions.

Let us imagine the cable extended below the horizontal plane of fixity and take

$$\varphi = \gamma - \theta, \quad -\gamma \leq \varphi \leq \gamma$$

The author's equation (18) then becomes

$$\varphi'' - \lambda^2 \sin \varphi = 0 \quad (1)$$

where primes denote derivatives with respect to  $s$ . According to [13] of this Discussion,

<sup>3</sup> Numbers in brackets designate References at end of Discussion.

<sup>4</sup> Professor of Engineering Mechanics, University of Detroit, Detroit, Mich. Mem. ASME.

<sup>5</sup> Professor of Civil Engineering, The University of Arizona, Tucson, Ariz.

<sup>6</sup> Numbers in brackets designate Additional References at end of Discussion.

$$\sin \varphi \approx \frac{2}{\gamma} J_1(\gamma)\varphi, \quad \cos \varphi \approx J_0(\gamma) \quad (2)$$

where  $J_0$  and  $J_1$  are the ordinary Bessel functions of the zeroth and first order, respectively. Substituting (2) into (1) and letting

$$k^2 = \frac{2}{\gamma} \lambda^2 J_1(\gamma) = \frac{2T^*}{\gamma EI} J_1(\gamma) \quad (3)$$

we obtain the approximate equation

$$\varphi'' - k^2 \varphi = 0 \quad (4)$$

which is satisfied by

$$\varphi = C_1 \sinh(ks) + C_2 \cosh(ks) \quad (5)$$

From the conditions  $\varphi = \gamma$  at  $s = 0$ ; and  $\varphi = 0$ ,  $M = -EI\varphi'' = 0$  at  $s = L$ ,

$$C_1 = -\gamma \coth(kL) = -\gamma \tanh(kL), \quad C_2 = \gamma \quad (6)$$

Hence,

$$\tanh(kL) = 1 \quad (7)$$

$$\varphi = \gamma[\cosh(ks) - \sinh(ks)] \quad (8)$$

$$M_0 = [2\gamma J_1(\gamma) EIT^*]^{1/2} \quad (9)$$

For example, for  $\gamma = 2$  ( $\gamma \approx 114.59$  deg), exact  $M_0 = 1.683(EIT^*)^{1/2}$ ; from equation (9),  $M_0 = 1.519(EIT^*)^{1/2}$ ; and by the small-angle approximation,  $M_0 = 2(EIT^*)^{1/2}$ . Of course, the accuracy of the method is much better for smaller angles.

## Additional References

- 10 Denman, H. H., and Howard, J. E., "Application of Ultra-spherical Polynomials to Nonlinear Oscillations—I. Free Oscillation of the Pendulum," *Quarterly of Applied Mathematics*, Vol. 21, No. 4, Jan. 1964, pp. 325-330.
- 11 Denman, H. H., and Schmidt, R., "Chebyshev Approximation Applied to Large Deflections of Elastica," *Industrial Mathematics, Journal of IMS*, Vol. 18, Part 2, 1968, pp. 63-74.
- 12 Denman, H. H., and Schmidt, R., "An Approximate Method of Analysis of Large Deflections," to appear in *Zeitschrift für angewandte Mathematik und Physik*.
- 13 Denman, H. H., "Computer Generation of Optimized Sub-routines," *Journal of the Association for Computing Machinery*, Vol. 8, No. 1, Jan. 1961, pp. 104-116.

## Author's Closure

The author would like to thank Professors Plunkett, Schmidt, and DaDeppo for their informative comments and the lists of additional references they have provided which include several related papers of which the author was unaware. In particular, it is gratifying to the author to know that some of the results of the paper have a wider range of application than indicated in the paper.

## Flow in a Two-Dimensional Channel With a Rectangular Cavity<sup>1</sup>

**ZĚV ROTEM.<sup>2</sup>** The authors are to be complimented on their investigation of this important problem which has a direct bearing

<sup>1</sup> By U. B. Mehta and Zalman Lavan, published in the December, 1969, issue of the JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS, Vol. 36, TRANS. ASME, Vol. 91, Series E, pp. 897-901.

<sup>2</sup> Professor, Department of Mechanical Engineering, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, B. C., Canada.

upon static hole errors for low and moderate Reynolds numbers  $Re$ .

It is interesting to compare the authors' results with those of previous investigators who examined more or less the same problem. Thus Thom and Apelt [1]<sup>3</sup> assumed a Poiseuille-type flow over their cavity of aspect ratio 2:1, and  $Re = 5$ . While these early results may not be particularly accurate, they are at variance with the results of the authors, and some discussion of this would seem valuable. A particular point in case would perhaps be the surprising degree of symmetry retained at  $Re = 100$  in the authors' results and the shape of the separating streamline. Burggraf [2] apparently does not find such a degree of symmetry in his case (which, however, assumed a different type of shear flow).

An interesting comparison could also be made with the various models which impose a rate of shear at the cavity upper ("free") surface [3-6] and with the recent treatment of the authors' case by O'Brien [7].

#### References

- 1 Thom, A., and Apelt, C. J., "The Pressure in a Two-Dimensional Static Hole at Low Reynolds Numbers," Aerospace Research Council Report and Memoranda No. 3090, H.M. Stationary Office, London, 1958, 13 pp.
- 2 Burggraf, O. R., "A Model of Separated Flow in Rectangular Cavities at High Reynolds Numbers," *Proceedings of the 1965 Heat Transfer and Fluid Mechanics Institute*, A. F. Charwat, ed., Stanford University Press 1965, pp. 190-229.
- 3 Greenspan, D., "Numerical Solution of a Class of Nonsteady Cavity Flow Problems," *BIT*, Vol. 8, 1968, pp. 287-294.
- 4 Ratkowsky, D. A., and Rotem, Ze'ev, "Viscous Flow in a Rectangular Cut Out," *The Physics of Fluids*, Vol. 11, 1968, pp. 2761-2763.
- 5 Greenspan, D., "Numerical Studies of Prototype Cavity Flow Problems," *The Computer Journal*, Vol. 12, 1969, pp. 89-94.
- 6 Rotem, Ze'ev, "Viscous Flow in Angle Sectors," to be published, 1969.
- 7 O'Brien, V., "Vortices in Viscous Shear Flows Over Wall Cavities," *Bulletin of the American Physical Society*, Division of Fluid Dynamics Meeting, Series 11, Vol. 14, 1969, p. 1088.

#### Authors' Closure

In comparing our results with those of other investigators it should be recalled that we considered a Couette flow over the cavity and that the Reynolds number is based on the velocity of the moving wall rather than the velocity at the free surface.

Thom and Apelt [8]<sup>4</sup> consider a Poiseuille flow over the cavity and obtain a dividing streamline that appears to start at the convex corners but dips lower than our dividing streamline. O'Brien [9, 10] has solved the same problem for both Couette and Poiseuille flow. She comes to the conclusion that "Poiseuille flows over cavities uniformly produce lower dividing streamlines than Couette flows for the same geometry."

The discussor correctly observes that in our case there is a large degree of symmetry at  $N_{Re} = 100$  while Burggraf [11] does not find such symmetry in his cavity flow with a scrapping lid at the same  $N_{Re}$ . The discrepancy is readily resolved if we recall that Burggraf's Reynolds number is based on the velocity of the upper cavity surface. Since in our problem the velocity of the cavity surface is approximately four percent of the velocity of the channel wall our Reynolds number of 100 corresponds to Burggraf's  $N_{Re}$  of approximately 8 for which case his structure would also be symmetric.

The shear and the velocity at the cavity upper ("free") surface is not constant in our problem (which models a two-dimensional static hole). Therefore, no quantitative comparison can be made between the present problem and investigations that consider constant shear [12] and constant velocity [11-14] at the free

Table 1

| $AR$ | $\psi_{max}$ |         | $h/AR$  |         |
|------|--------------|---------|---------|---------|
|      | O'Brien      | Present | O'Brien | Present |
| 1.0  | 0.0102       | 0.0121  | 0.933   | 0.962   |
| 2.0  | 0.0105       | 0.0125  | 0.9665  | 0.9875  |

surface. Qualitatively, we see the similar flow phenomenon in both problems.

O'Brien [9] should be complimented for her thorough and careful investigation of vortices in viscous shear flows over wall cavities. She considers an identical geometry to ours and obtained solutions for  $N_{Re} = 0$ . We can compare her results [15] with our calculations at  $N_{Re} = 1$ .

1 In both cases the dividing streamline originates at the convex corners and is concave. The lowest height ( $h/AR$ ) of O'Brien's dividing streamline is lower than ours; see Table 1 of this Closure.

2 While the flow structure is similar in both cases the actual values differ considerably. The values of  $\psi_{max}$  for two geometries are shown in Table 1 of this Closure.

It should be pointed out that for the scrapping lid problem at  $N_{Re} = 0$  our results agree within 4.5 percent with those of O'Brien. The larger discrepancy in the cavity problem is most likely due to computational difficulties associated with the singular nature of the convex corners.

#### References

- 8 Thom, A., and Apelt, C. J., "The Pressure in a Two-Dimensional Static Hole at Low Reynolds Numbers," *Aero. Research Council, Report and Memoranda No. 3090*, H.M. Stationary Office, London, 1958, 13 pp.
- 9 O'Brien, V., "Vortices in Viscous Shear Flows Over Wall Cavities," *Bulletin of the American Physical Society*, Division of Fluid Dynamics Meeting, Series 11, Vol. 14, 1969, p. 1088.
- 10 O'Brien, V., "Poiseuille Flows With Boundary Disturbances," *The Johns Hopkins University, Applied Physics Laboratory, Technical Memorandum TG-814*, Mar. 1966.
- 11 Burggraf, O. R., "A Model of Separated Flow in Rectangular Cavities at High Reynolds Numbers," *Proceedings of the 1965 Heat Transfer and Fluid Mechanics Institute*, Charwat, A. F., ed., Stanford University Press, 1965, pp. 190-229.
- 12 Ratkowsky, D. A., and Rotem, Z., "Viscous Flow in a Rectangular Cut Out," *The Physics of Fluids*, Vol. 11, 1968, pp. 2761-2763.
- 13 Greenspan, D., "Numerical Solution of Class of Nonsteady Cavity Flow Problems," *BIT*, Vol. 8, 1968, pp. 287-294.
- 14 Greenspan, D., "Numerical Studies of Prototype Cavity Flow Problems," *The Computer Journal*, Vol. 12, 1969, pp. 89-94.
- 15 O'Brien, V., private communication.

## Buckling of Composite and Homogeneous Isotropic Cylindrical Shells Under Axial and Radial Loading<sup>1</sup>

G. WEMPNER.<sup>2</sup> The authors have managed to obtain relatively simple buckling modes which fulfill eight different boundary conditions by imposing two simultaneous equations involving the circumferential wavelength and the critical load (or axial length). Simultaneous solutions of the polynomial and transcendental equations are obtained numerically by a procedure of trial and correction. A difficult problem has been treated in a thorough manner and useful numerical results have been given. However, several questions arise.

<sup>1</sup> By M. M. Lei and Shun Cheng, published in the December, 1969, issue of the *JOURNAL OF APPLIED MECHANICS*, Vol. 36, TRANS. ASME, Vol. 91, Series E, pp. 791-798.

<sup>2</sup> Research Institute, University of Alabama, Huntsville, Ala.

<sup>3</sup> Numbers in brackets designate References at end of Discussion.

<sup>4</sup> Numbers in brackets designate References at end of Closure.